TOULL BENCHMARKING

25.02.13

Introduction: Benchmarking process

A central part of the preparation for development of new activities within the TOULL Tempus project is a benchmarking exercise which will bring together Russian and EU/international experiences within five key areas. In parallel with this, an investigation into perceptions of training needs by tourism stakeholder is undertaken in the four Russian regions. The role of the benchmarking exercise will be to complement stakeholder views by mobilizing the knowledge of partners concerning lifelong learning in tourism and triple helix collaboration between industry, government and knowledge institutions in this increasingly important field of social activity. The process involved two steps:

1. All EU partners/ATLAS experts was given the opportunity to provide input on the basis of jointly agreed template with regard to
    a. Relevant experience within their own institution
    b. Relevant experience within their own country
    c. Other relevant experience, e.g. examples of good practice (or very bad practice) from other countries
    d. What is needed is a short description of the activity, references to where more information can be found (publications, websites), and a brief comment on the relevance for the TOULL project
2. Based on this input, a report synthesising the findings has been put together, providing suggestions for future TOULL activities and form part of the background material for the May 2013 TOULL seminar in Chemorovo.

Input was provided by Dieter Müller (Umeå), Constantia Anastasiadou (Napier), Michael Mair (FHWien), Angela Benson (Brighton), and Terry Brathwaite (Coventry). The report was drafted by Henrik Halkier (Aalborg) in February 2013.

1. Vocational education and training programmes in tourism

Lifelong learning is at the core of TOULL, and one of the outputs of the project is to design training measures that can

1. Provide retraining of unemployed academics to give them skills and competences to work in tourism
2. Provide specialized in-job training targeting specific industry needs
3. Establish a series of workshops aimed at bringing private/public practitioners and educators/researchers together around themes of common concern.

This section summarises the findings of EU partners, links to relevant websites and documents can be found in the Table at the back of the text.

1.1 Retraining programmes for academics

Retraining programmes for academics vary according to the general educational context, primarily the extent to which it is common for graduates to return to university/training after having started their working career. In some countries, e.g. the UK and Austria, returning to improve competences or get specialized knowledge would seem to be relatively well-establish, while in Scandinavia this seems to take place on a much more limited scale, although possibilities exist and in e.g. Denmark graduates are starting to make use of the possibility of paying to participate in individual courses offered as part of mainstream university programmes.

A basic distinction can be drawn between short and long courses (e.g. 1-year Master programmes), where the short courses tend to be more specialized and in practice to overlap with specialized in-job training to a considerable extent. Themes cover lots of different topics relating to tourism and hospitality (see examples in the Table at the end of the document), reflecting the competences of the institutions offering the courses, and what is seen as pertinent to the national/local demand for highly-skilled employees.

This highlight the importance of being as clear as possible about needs, and this is often done by relying on input from the future employers of trainees, i.e. the local tourism industry. While this is of course an important source of information, it also introduces a potential bias in the sense that managers often will seek to solve their immediate staffing problems rather than look for long-term flexible employees that can also help to address future challenges.

A possible way of addressing this dilemma could be to establish a distinction between on the one hand *short courses* of a relatively hands-on and practical nature, and *long courses* (1 year or more) which need to focus not just on immediately useful competences but also could focus on building the problem-solving capacity of participants so that they will be able to contribute to the development of activities also in a long-term perspective.

The table at the back of the report provides links to programmes which may serve as inspiration for development of courses etc. in the TOULL project.

1.2 Specialized in-job training

The term in-job training covers two types of (typically short) training courses: courses that individual employees attend in order to improve their competences, and courses organized by employers in order to develop particular skills within their organisation. The first type has been covered in section 1.1 above, and this section concentrates on the second type which is delivered in collaboration with external sponsors.

Examples include both courses developed by e.g. universities and offered to potential corporate clients, and tailor-made courses developed in collaboration between industry actors and public knowledge institutions, to some extent supported by local/regional development bodies (e.g. in Britain). In some cases (e.g. Strathclyde University, Scotland) this is organized through a special center within the university (cf. the table at the back of the text), while in other cases (e.g. in Sweden) some programmes have even taken on a life of their own and become separate institutions with little or no continuing input from universities.

Here the short-term needs of employers are obviously crucial to activities, and the role of universities as trainers is to provide three types of value-added (compared to alternative training providers), namely the high-level competences of trainers, provision of formally recognised qualifications (cf. the Scottish examples), and the more intangible advantage of being associated with a highly-regarded knowledge institution.

The table at the back of the report provides links to activities in this area which may serve as inspiration for development of courses etc. in the TOULL project.

1.3 Practitioner workshops

Practitioner workshops take place in connection with most EU partner universities, sometimes as a specific form of short-term training event for employees of a particular company, sometimes offered by universities to a wider practitioner public (although perhaps developed in collaboration with a particular client), sometimes as a way to publicize e.g. findings from a research project that are of particular relevance to a practitioner audience. Themes for workshops therefore vary a lot, from training activities developing particular practical skills, via strategy-building exercises for middle-managers, to discussions of practical implications of new research results.

The level of public funding for such workshops varies, from being funding by the university itself as part of general dissemination obligation and/or corporate PR, to activities being subsidized by local/regional government as part of efforts to increase competences in the tourism sector, and even ending up as self-financing entities based on participant fees (c.f. examples from Sweden).

The table at the back of the report provides links to activities in this area which may serve as inspiration for development of courses etc. in the TOULL project.

2. Problem-based Learning

The pedagogical approach at the core of the project is problem-based learning (PBL), and a short PBL manual (guidance document) will be elaborated by Michal Mair and Henrik Halkier in the first half of 2013.

The aim of this part of the benchmarking exercise has therefore been relative limited, namely to provide preliminary inspiration by collecting links to information about different approaches to PBL.

At the moment PBL is practiced in a number of different ways by partner institutions in the EU and Russia, and the benchmarking exercise not only underlined this diversity but also demonstrated that approaches have been developing gradually within individual institutions. This suggests that there is not only one approach, but that PBL must evolve to suit local circumstances and institutional requirements.

It is therefore also unsurprising that PBL is being used as a pedagogical strategy not just in mainstream full-time university programmes, but also in the context of life-long learning (and to a lesser extent practitioner-oriented workshops). It could be argued that PBL is particularly *necessary* in full-time programmes with relatively young students because it introduces an important degree of realism in learning and prepares them for the complex challenges of working life. But at the same time PBL could also be seen as particular *useful* in a life-long learning context because it helps to bring the experience of more mature students into the class-room discussions.

The table at the back of the report provides links to PBL guides, introductions and activities which may serve as inspiration for development of courses etc. in the TOULL project, and which will also provide additional input for the elaboration of the TOULL PBL manual.

3. Training laboratories as pedagogical strategy

The setting up of laboratories as training facilities to be used as part of lifelong learning programmes/courses is an integrated part of the TOULL project, and each university/region will identify possibilities that suit their particular circumstances. In order to aid the process of identifying facilities that could perform the role of laboratories, input about the following areas has been identified:

1. Examples of laboratories being used as part of academic and/or lifelong learning programmes in tourism or other service industries (many training facilities may have a rather practical nature
2. Examples of how the pedagogics of laboratories in relation to the academic programmes/courses which the students are following
3. Examples of the organization of laboratory facilities (e.g. integrated in university, use of on-campus facilities run by external providers, use of external facilities)

This section summarises the findings of EU partners, links to relevant websites and documents can be found in the Table at the back of the text.

3.1 Examples of laboratories

The examples collected demonstrate that term laboratory is used to refer to rather different things, namely

- dedicated facilities for training of particular (typically practical) competences, e.g. service activities relating to catering or accommodation (e.g. in Vienna and Umeå)
- a framework for collaboration with external stakeholders around joint problem-solving, with (UK) or without (Napier, Aalborg) a built-in training element

The latter are clearly relevant in relation to Tourism Resource Centres and similar triple-helix arrangements, both with or without student involvement. However, in the context of TOULL the former are probably what the Russian partners have been looking for.

3.2 Pedagogics of laboratories

Some laboratories are used on a regular basis for training of students as part of mainstream programmes, either in mainly practical competences (Sweden, Austria) or with regard to more general problem-solving competences (UK examples). But in some cases (Napier) laboratory-type facilities also offer an additional activity for students, focusing on direct interaction with industry stakeholders.

3.3 Organization of laboratory facilities

Facilities are tailor-made for training purposes and integrated in the university organisations, although in some cases (Denmark, UK?, Napier?) partly co-financed by external industry partners. No examples have

been identified where e.g. existing university catering facilities have been used for training purposes, so if this approach is being pursued by TOULL partners, it could be seen as an innovative way of providing short-term internships with possibilities for close pedagogical supervision.

4. Advanced web portals in education/dissemination

The setting up of an advanced interactive web portal is an integrated part of the TOULL project, providing a platform for dialogue and distribution of materials that 1) supports both the training programmes/courses and 2) provides the Tourism Resource Centres (TRCs) with a permanent digital presence for users in the four regions and beyond. Ideally it is possible to identify one solution that covers both needs, but as a fall-back option EU partners have also been checking out solutions that split the functions between two platforms, because if no good integrated solution can be found, then combining two separate platforms that each are excellent in their own field may be preferable. Input about the following areas has been identified:

1. Examples of websites that integrate an interactive learning platform for students with a public interface for industry/policy practitioners
2. Examples of websites that provides an interactive platform for students in lifelong learning (e.g. Moodle-type solutions)
3. Examples of websites that integrate an interactive interface between knowledge institutions and industry/policy practitioners

This section summarises the findings of EU partners, links to relevant websites and documents can be found in the Table at the back of the text.

4.1 Platforms integrating training and stakeholder relations

No examples of integrated platforms have been identified, probably because training-oriented platforms are typically designed so that they are convenient for students and staff rather than of a promotional nature. In practice this means that TOULL activities will probably have to rely on two platforms, on for the students enrolled in training and one for stakeholder relation purposes.

This will probably also mean that e.g. practitioner workshops will have to be managed separately, because enrolling practitioners in e.g. Moodle in connection with participation in a one-day workshop is simply too cumbersome, both for participants and the persons administering the event in the university. Fortunately several sensible solutions for event management is available as freeware, or for smaller events using e.g. Google Docs can be an easy-to-manage alternative.

4.2 Platforms for life-long learning

A number of e-learning platforms exist such as Moodle, FirstClass, etc., which started out being designed for distance learning but have gradually become integrated in mainstream university programmes across universities in Europe. Nowadays every student is in other words to some extent being treated/serviced as a distance learner, something which means that the running of software etc. is no longer just a task for life-long learning programmes but is being shared across all university programmes.

In the context of TOULL it could there make sense

- if the university already uses e-learning platforms for mainstream or life-long learning programmes, then use the same programmes, makes it easier for programme administrators in terms of support etc.
- if the university do NOT use e-learning platforms at the moment, then choosing a platform in widespread use (e.g. Moodle) could be best idea, because others have paid the up-front development costs in terms of ridding the platform of minor faults etc.

If in demand, a special session/seminar on the use of this kind of platforms could be as part of the TOULL project.

Finally a number of UK policy documents have been identified which could be worth consulting for inspiration about the pedagogics of life-long and/or distance learning, these can be found in the table at the back of the document.

4.3 Platforms for stakeholder relations

A number of different platforms used for stakeholder involvement, and two basic versions can be identifies:

- some are essentially dissemination platforms, communicating joint university-industry projects and other triple-helix activities to a wider audience, and therefore they primarily function as one-way communication where the university pass on information to industry and other interested parties about research findings, projects, etc.
- others are interactive in the sense that users (industry, policy practitioners) produce significant part of the content, either directly by writing it or indirectly by asking questions that are then answered by university staff (or other practitioners)

Key issues that need to be addressed within TOULL includes three strategic decisions

- to what extent, if at all, should non-university users provide input to the platform?
- how much content should be pre-produced by TOULL partners to make the website attractive to visit?
- what should the balance be between dissemination of 'general' knowledge about tourism development, and 'specific' promotion of e.g. collaborative projects or possibilities for collaboration about future projects? While the first option will looking 'informative' (traditional university role), the second would look more 'commercial' (trying to promote services to industry)?

Browsing the websites in the table at the back of the document can hopefully provide inspiration for deciding on the profile of the TOULL/TRC platform.

5. Triple-helix interface organisations

The establishing of Tourism Resource Centres (TRCs) in the four regions is an integrated part of the TOULL project, bringing together knowledge institutions, industry and policymakers to share experience and development new projects of mutually beneficient nature. Such collaborative arrangements have existed in a variety of forms in many EU countries for some time, including some in tourism, and in order to aid the process of developing the four TOULL centres, input about the following issues has been identified:

1. Examples of institutions that provide a platform for triple-helix collaboration in tourism
2. Examples of activities that help to ensure long-term integration of users into centre, e.g. benchmarking/performance indicator data collection for regional tourism industry, or the use of alumni networks to create links/goodwill/new projects.
3. The organization of such platforms, including input of industry/government/universities in establishing/funding the centres and their activities, how access to activities/resources are organized (fee per activity, club-type arrangements, free), and the possible role of the Centres as providers/brokers of consultancy services by university staff.

This section summarises the findings of EU partners, links to relevant websites and documents can be found in the Table at the back of the text.

5.1 Platforms for triple-helix collaboration

The examples identified demonstrate that collaboration between universities, industry and government takes place in two different ways:

- online platforms
- physical meetings/workshops

While the former makes it easier for industry/practitioners to access information quickly and at their own convenience, the latter clearly has its strength in the possibility for interactive exchanges, not just between universities and practitioners, but also amongst practitioners themselves.

In addition to this, examples exist of less permanent, more project-based, types of collaboration where universities and public/private stakeholders collaborate around specific development projects for a limited period of time. If project-based collaboration is repeated on a regular basis with more or less the same partners (as has been the in e.g. Aalborg/North Jutland), then this would seem to constitute a more informal version of triple-helix collaboration.

5.2 User integration through activities

The choice of platform is also reflected in the different ways in which users are integrated into activities so that they become a permanent presence in the collaboration, with the two main approaches being

- one-way dissemination of research results and tourism activity surveys

- interactive forms with an active role for users, in which the latter either sets the agenda or provides additional information inputs, in one case (TourMIS in Austria) even to some extent linked to training activities

Again the advantages of both one-way dissemination (access to standardized information) and interactive forms (tailorised access to information relevant to individual actors) are obvious.

In an ideal world different platforms and ways of engaging users could be combined in the new TRCs, the key issue would seem to be what to prioritise in terms of developing a platform that is gest capable of engaging local industry actors.

5.3 Triple-helix organisation

Institutionalised collaboration between universities, industry and government in tourism has been initiated by all three parties, sometimes alone (often industry-driven initiatives with marginal university role), sometimes through bilateral arrangements between universities and e.g. tourism development bodies, and occasionally through government bringing private actors and knowledge institutions together in more permanent arrangements. Clearly there is no one model on which the TRCs can be based, and the task of TOULL will be to find the right balance between activities and an organisational framework that is conducive to these activities.

However, under all circumstances it will important to retain a well-defined role for all three stakeholders so that the universities are not reduced to the status of R&D departments for industry and/or government, and avoid being caught up in whatever current short-term preoccupations (e.g. next year's visitor figures, or political re-election). The relevance of universities as producers of new knowledge, also from the perspective of government and industry, is exactly this, namely their capacity to think and speak independently from a long-term perspective as internationally recognised as providers of specialist knowledge. This does in no way precluded close and ongoing collaboration, but in order for all stakeholders to gain from this, the main contribution of universities as providers of access to reliable new knowledge, must be preserved.

TOULL BENCHMARKING TABLE

1. Vocational education and training programmes in tourism

1.1A. Short retraining programmes for academics	
UK: Many universities, including Open University and Coventry University, run a number of CPD (Continuing professional Development) short courses	http://www3.open.ac.uk/study/professional-skills/travel-planning/index.htm http://wwwm.coventry.ac.uk/cuc/courses/Pages/Courses.aspx
AUSTRIA: WIFI is the Economic Development Institute and the vocational education and training institute of the Austrian Chamber of Commerce – annually 350,000 customers, 31,000 seminars and training courses in 10 WIFI locations in the CEE/SEE area (www.wifi.eu). Courses cost between €100 and €5,000 and are paid for by the participants themselves (some financial support is offered by the Austrian Public Employment Service.) In the field of tourism, courses and training (from 2 to 200 teaching units) are offered in the following areas: Bartender, Event Manager, Food and Beverage Manager, Tour Guide, Wine and Cheese Sommelier, Chef.	http://www.wifi.at/DE/Kursbuch/Branchen/Tourismus/tourismus.aspx
AUSTRIA: BFI is a worker-oriented vocational education and training institute of the Federal Chamber of Labour (AK) and the Austrian Trade Union Confederation – annually more than 41,000 participants in over 3,300 training courses. Courses are aimed at employed and unemployed workers and also companies. 75% of the revenue is generated through the Austrian Public Employment Service, the remaining from privately financed courses. In the field of tourism, courses and training are offered in the following areas: Housekeeping, Receptionist, Cook, Tour Guide, Travel agency worker, Sauna and Pool Hygienist, Home Economics	http://www.bfi-wien.at/kursangebote/ausbildung-tourismus/
DENMARK: Less emphasis on such programmes, perhaps due to relatively long degree courses, but most universities offer something, cf. the link to the AAU website. Some tourism development bodies such as VisitNordjylland provides extensive competence development, co-funding by EU Structural Funds; many of these courses are for front-line staff and have a relatively practical nature.	http://www.en.evu.aau.dk/ http://www.visitnordjylland.dk/kurser (in Danish)
GLOBAL: Link to retraining courses run as part of international development programmes, in this case Canadian efforts in Peru	http://international.niagaracollege.ca/content/Opportunities/InternationalDevelopment/CurrentProjects/ProjectsinPeru.aspx
1.1B. Long full-time programmes	
FRANCE: MA Leisure and Tourism (in English / French) Virtual learning platform – Ecole de Normandy. Students can take individual modules. E.g. sustainable tourism which I wrote and manage. Link is through Olivier KOVARSKI (o.kovarski@em-normandie.fr)	http://www.ecole-management-normandie.fr/english/facts_figures.html
AUSTRIA: My institute offers a one year program for chefs who like to become entrepreneurs – but it is not limited for academics. We support the participants in the process of starting a gastronomic company. The program is financed by the participants and costs 5.000.- EURO. With about 5-8 participants per year we are not too successful.	http://www.fh-wien.ac.at/gastro-kulinarikmanagement/
DENMARK: AAU as example	http://www.tourism.aau.dk/
UK: Coventry as example	http://wwwm.coventry.ac.uk/cuc/courses/Pages/Courses.aspx
UK: Executive Masters in Hospitality and Tourism Leadership- Joining forces with the International Leadership School (ILS), Cornell University	http://www.strath.ac.uk/business/cee/htleadership/

and Ecole hôtelière de Lausanne, 12 intensive modules are delivered over two years in Glasgow, Lausanne, and New York. The final element of the programme involves a real life business analysis exercise, followed by the Leadership project. The final project can be undertaken as an individual piece of work, or as a group exercise. *Relevance to TOULL*: This is an example of a course delivered in three different locations geared towards managers in the tourism and hospitality industry. It could be used as an inspiration in the design of programmes by the Russian partners to allow cooperation between them and give the opportunity to the students to study tourism related matters within a specific context (i.e. sustainability issues in Tomsk versus Kemerovo).	http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/faculties/business/cee/htl/Executive_Masters_HospitalityTourismLeadership.pdf
HONG KONG: DBA awards in Hospitality and Tourism. The Doctor of Hotel and Tourism Management designed to cater to the needs of senior industry executives, senior staff in governmental and non-governmental tourism organisations and academics who are seeking a professional doctorate in hotel and tourism management. Learning and teaching methods are participant centred, with a significant emphasis on experiential exercises, seminars and self-guided study. Individual subjects are designed to focus on innovation, creativity and developing research skills in the dynamic hotel and tourism management sector, all within the unique Asian context. *Relevance to TOULL*: This type of programme could be created to assist in the retraining of academic staff in tourism and hospitality by offering them the possibility go gain a professional doctorate.	http://hotelschool.shtm.polyu.edu.hk/eng/academic/programs_overview.jsp?ID=18&Tag=1&Program=dhtm&SubProg=&SA=posthk
TRINIDAD-TOBAGO: Hospitality-oriented examples with international collaborative relations	http://www.hospitalitytnt.com/course.asp?course_id=37 http://tthti.edu.tt/images/editorfiles/BSc%20Culinary%20Management.pdf
1.2. Specialised in-job training	
AUSTRALIA: Tourism e-kit as example	http://www.atdw.com.au/tourismekit.aspx
GLOBAL: list of available eLearning courses for travel agents about tourism destinations around the globe	http://www.elearning4tourism.com/elearning-programs/
EUROPE: Example of distance learning in tourism for professionals in EU report – see p 112	http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/EN/Files/5161_en.pdf
UK: Industry does approach university to write curriculum for them. An example of this is 'Airmiles' staff from my school wrote modules and delivered these in the workplace for them. This changed with the incoming of a CEO. University of Bournemouth offer this facility on their website.	http://www.bournemouth.ac.uk/tourism/study/cpd.html
UK: Executive Certificate in Events Management – Four-day intensive course. The programme is designed to enhance the professional skill and knowledge base of those already within the industry – paid by the participants or their employers. *Relevance to TOULL*: This is a very good example of intensive, focused seminars that the Russian partners could develop to cater not just for industry but also local authorities that may not have the know-how in tourism.	http://www.napier.ac.uk/EILMP/courses/Documents/Events-Management-brochure.pdf http://www.napier.ac.uk/EILMP/COURSES/TESTIMONIALS/Pages/ExecutiveCertificateinEventManagement.aspx
UK: Edinburgh Napier University provides in-house training for businesses that is formally accredited, so that employees who complete the course receive national qualifications.	http://www.napier.ac.uk/business/training/Pages/inhouse-training.aspx http://www.napier.ac.uk/creditrating/Pages/Home.aspx

UK: Partnerships with organisations such as Scottish Government, Scottish Enterprise, Highlands and Islands Enterprise, local authorities, and Chambers of Commerce to ensure we have a joined-up approach to improving our economic impact. Through these partnerships different types of funding is available to underwrite the costs of collaborating to help develop business. The university advises on opportunities and assist with the application process.	http://www.napier.ac.uk/business/funding/Pages/home.aspx
UK: Centre for Corporate Connections and Executive Education- Strathclyde University – Knowledge exchange - providing a catalyst that delivers effective industry/ academic collaboration.- This is another university's approach to the organisation of courses specifically for businesses. *Relevance to TOULL*: These courses bring academia and industry together some of which is sponsored by government sources. It can be particularly useful in delivering specific local government objectives (i.e. continuous professional development of the workforce). It might be particularly suited for some of the larger employers in tourism, including government agencies and organisations.	http://www.strath.ac.uk/business/cee/ http://www.strath.ac.uk/business/cee/approach/
SWEDEN: TourQuality focusing on service quality – today a private company, participation fees	http://www.tourquality.se/
SWEDEN: Restaurangakademin	http://www.restaurangakademien.se/
1.3. Practitioner workshops	
UK: Masterclass- one day intensive seminar – these are usually very focused on one subject/theme and the speakers are well established. The participants or the organisations that employ them pay- often they may be working for local authorities and have a remit in tourism. *Relevance to TOULL*: This is a very good example of intensive, focused seminars that the Russian partners could develop to cater not just for industry but also local authorities that may not have the know-how in tourism.	http://www.tmi.org.uk/documents/citybrandingmasterclassflyerapril2012.pdf http://www.hie.co.uk/growth-sectors/tourism/webinar-series.html
AUSTRIA: The Austrian Society of Applied Research in Tourism (ASART) / Vienna University of Economics and Business – "Experts' Dialogue" - tourism practitioner dialogues to promote knowledge exchange between researchers and practitioners in the tourism industry. Fees*: (ASART)* regular members €80; supporting members €460; educational institutions/NGOs €345. Held several times a year, supported by Austrian Federal Ministry of Economy, Family & Youth. ASART membership decided by its board.	http://www.oegaf.org/ http://www.wu.ac.at/sm/pr/experts_dialogue
AUSTRIA*:* FHWien der WKW – 'TM Talks' - Regular tourism practitioner talks by tourism industry professionals (including FHWien graduates). Regularly organised by FHWien Tourism institute - Speakers present projects/ideas/innovations/companies followed by Q&A session. TM talks consist of 'standalone' talks as well as theme 'series', e.g. 'Social Media & Tourism'. No fees paid to speakers or by participants.	http://www.fh-wien.ac.at/news/detail/tm-talks-fernweh-von-glueck-lust-und-frust-auf-reisen-754/
AUSTRIA: Vienna Modul University/Austrian National Tourism office. - annual TourMIS Users' Workshop and International Seminar on Key Performance Indicators for Destination Marketing. Evaluation and monitoring of tourism marketing activities allowing managers to develop marketing strategies. Organised jointly by the European Travel Commission, United Nations World Tourism Organization, European Cities Marketing and MODUL University Vienna.	http://www.modul.ac.at/sites/modul/files/Program%20TourMIS%20Workshop%202012.pdf
SWEDEN: Nature's Best quality label – private organization, participation	http://www.ekoturism.org/

fees - Pretty good, not least regarding business development	
UK: Sussex Learning Network (SLN) is based at the university of Brighton. The Sussex Learning Network is a strategic partnership of higher education providers, further education colleges and local authorities based in Sussex. Together we are working to transform vocational higher education in Sussex.	http://www.sussexlearningnetwork.org.uk/documents/case-studies/ http://www.sussexlearningnetwork.org.uk/employer-engagement/
UK: Crowd Management Seminar- This was an event organised for event professionals by Event Scotland (a public funded body) and the Edinburgh Institute in Tourism and Events (Edinburgh Napier). Included an element of networking which is always attractive with industry professionals. *Relevance to TOULL*: This type of short workshops may be particularly useful in raising awareness of the academic institutions areas of interest and potential involvement in consultancy work for the industry. In my School's case they are a great way to publicize more widely the existence of the designated Institute that is expected to generate income from industry sources.	http://cmseminarmurrayfield.eventbrite.com/
UK: Run by Edinburgh Tourism Action Group and supported by Scottish Enterprise, these are workshops that are designed specifically for managers, owners and staff in tourism and hospitality businesses. They run throughout the year and in different locations across Scotland. They are advertised through local associations' websites as well as the dedicated Tourism Intelligence Scotland website. *Relevance to TOULL*: These seminars are great examples of focused training sessions for industry professionals. They are not delivered by university academics as such but academics could be invited as speakers.	http://www.tourism-intelligence.co.uk/TIS/News%20and%20Events/Events/Listening%20To%20Our%20Visitors%20Workshops.aspx http://www.tourism-intelligence.co.uk/News-and-Events/Events/BTS-Focus-Groups.aspx?pageNo=1
UK: Highlands and Islands Enterprise tourism masterclass. Highlands and Islands Enterprise's (HIE) series of eight online masterclasses to help tourism businesses capitalise on the opportunities being generated as part of the Year of Natural Scotland 2013 ran between October and December. The live webcasts shared best practice and offered insights on Scotland's growth markets, delivered through the stories of industry leaders and by enabling business-to-business interaction. Participants benefited from practical tips on how to attract and excite potential customers, and hear what other businesses have done successfully to improve their profitability. HIE funded the series of webinars with support from Forestry Commission Scotland. Other in-kind support has been received from the Scottish Tourism Alliance, VisitScotland, Scottish Enterprise, Wild Scotland and SNH. *Relevance to TOULL*: These workshops webinars were ran online and are still available for practitioners to access. Notice also the range of organisations that have funded or supported the event (including industry, [Scottish Tourism Alliance], national government [Scottish Enterprise], as well as charitable organisations (Scottish Natural Heritage-SNH]).	http://www.hie.co.uk/growth-sectors/tourism/webinar-series.html
UK: The purpose of the programme is to enhance leadership skills in the tourism industry in Scotland. It is based on an existing programme taught in Melbourne Australia. Structure: Five full day workshops focused on the key components of the customer journey • Three residential weekend workshops focused on developing leadership skills • An assessed leadership project This innovative programme is subsidized by Scottish Enterprise, working with the St Andrews Partnership and the Edinburgh Tourism Action	http://www.napier.ac.uk/EILMP/courses/dlp/Pages/Destination-Leaders-Programme.aspx http://www.destinationmelbourne.com.au/industry/melbourne-tourism-industry-leadership-program/

Group. It will eventually roll out to the rest of Scotland.	

2. Problem-based Learning

2A. Brief guides to PBL	
UK: The HE Academy UK has funded several projects linked to PBL. The website is the one associated with sport, leisure and social sciences, other links detail how PBL has been applied across the UK educational sector.	http://www.heacademy.ac.uk/assets/hlst/documents/resources/ssg_pbl_casestudies.pdf http://www.heacademy.ac.uk/assets/documents/aboutus/scotland/SHEER_MacAndrew.pdf http://www.heacademy.ac.uk/resources/detail/subjects/medev/Problem-based_learning-_a_practical_guide_(15)
DENMARK: AAU as example	http://www.en.aau.dk/About+Aalborg+University/The+Aalborg+model+for+problem+based+learning+(PBL)/ http://www.plan.aau.dk/digitalAssets/5/5486_workingpaper132006.pdf http://www.ucpbl.net/global-network
GLOBAL: Examples	http://people.uleth.ca/~em.pijlzieber/Em_Pijl-Zieber_UofL.pdf http://www.ojs.unisa.edu.au/index.php/atna/article/viewFile/368/242 http://www.heacademy.ac.uk/assets/ps/documents/primers/ps0090_web_resources_for_problem_based_learning_mar_2005.pdf
AUSTRIA: Introductory video	http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gE04TbxQWS8
GLOBAL: Examples of Problem-Based Learning Networks	http://www.edineb.org/home.asp (Educational Innovation in Economics and Business) http://pbln.imsa.edu/ (Illinois Mathematics and Science Academy) http://ctlt.ubc.ca/programs/communities-of-practice/problem-based-learning-network/ (University of British Columbia) http://www.facilitate.ie/ (A PBL Network) http://feedback.bton.ac.uk/pbl/pbldirectory/index.php (PBL Directory)
GLOBAL: Examples of Problem-Based Learning Users	http://www.maastrichtuniversity.nl/web/Main/Education1/ProblemBasedLearning.htm (University of Maastricht)

	http://www.udel.edu/inst/ (University of Delware)
	http://www.mcli.dist.maricopa.edu/pbl/info.html (Maricopa Center for Learning and Instruction)
	http://www.hku.hk/speech/pbl/Guided_Tour/guidedtour.htm (University of Hong Kong)
	http://www.cotf.edu/ete/teacher/teacherout.html (University of Köln)
	http://www.materials.qmul.ac.uk/pbl/ (Queen Mary, University of London)
2B. PBL and lifelong learning	
UK: Examples	http://coventryuniversity.podbean.com/2007/06/25/problem-based-learning-maggi-savin-baden/
	http://wwwm.coventry.ac.uk/pbl2011/Pages/Conferencethemes.aspx
EUROPE: Example (p 112)	http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/EN/Files/5161_en.pdf
WEST INDIES: Example	http://fhs.mcmaster.ca/globalhealthoffice/video.html
AUSTRIA: The WIFI organisation started to introduce a new didactical strategy for all their seminars and trainings. The strategy is called LENA with means translated "alive" and "sustainable". Prof. Rolf Arnold is the father of this approach and it is very close to PBL. They started to train all their trainers within this method and I think this approach could be very useful for our project.	www.wifi.at/lernen http://www.wifi.at/DE/Service/WIFI-Lernmodell%20LENA/Was%20ist%20das%20WIFI-Lernmodel5933/WIFI-Lernmodell+LENA.aspx
2C. PBL and practitioner-oriented workshops	
DK: PBL-type elements have been used in practitioner workshops in connection with dissemination activities. Example:	http://www.fremtidensferiehus.aau.dk/Gruppediskussioner+ifm.+afsluttende+seminar/

3. Training laboratories

3.1. Examples of laboratories	
AUSTRIA: The Hotel- und Tourismusschulen MODUL have laboratory-style facilities, and our students use trainings kitchens/restaurants/bars. Access can perhaps be organised as part of study visits.	www.modul.at
SWEDEN: Umeå University School of Restaurant and Culinary Arts has kitchen and restaurant facilities – but their operation are costly and capacity constraints a problem (shared with nutrition)	http://www.rh.umu.se/english/
UK: Examples of laboratories used as a pedagogical frame for training and at the same time as platform for collaboration with external stakeholders.	http://www.sustainabletourismlab.com/aboutsustainabletourismgeotourismlab.htm http://www.sussexlearningnetwork.org.uk/doc

UK: The Edinburgh Institute is dedicated to improving leadership and management through practice-based learning. There is a designated Tourism and Events division that organises outward facing seminars and workshops. *Relevance to TOULL*: The EI has struggled to identify a clear focus within the Edinburgh Napier Business School – it has had to restructure quite a few times- the difficulty has been in identifying a clear remit- is this to be a consultancy and commercial income raising organisation? Or should it be involved in designing and delivering specialised courses for industry? Staff in the Business School is still unsure of what the EI actually does… but the specialised divisions appear to have been more successful in securing income. The new director, who was previously in charge of Edinburgh City Chamber, is expected to make broad changes to the way it operates to improve efficiency and achieve more tangible results. In other words: an interesting concept but difficult to implement.	http://www.napier.ac.uk/EILMP/Pages/Home.aspx http://www.napier.ac.uk/EILMP/Pages/OurServices.aspx
UK: *Bright Red Triangle* recruits undergraduate, postgraduate and doctoral students to complete projects for external organisations. Bright Red Triangle is intended to create and develop relationships which could provide career paths for graduates and at the same time enhance the competitive edge of the local business community resulting in enhanced economic growth. *Relevance to TOULL*: This initiative creates direct linkages between the university and local businesses by encouraging the employment of the graduates. Edinburgh Napier university depends on the links with former graduates who are employed in the tourism and hospitality industry to secure student projects, study placements, site visits and industry talks as well as raising sponsorship and scholarships for students. At the same time it helps improve the employability potential of University graduates and hence improve its overall reputation. The Russian partners could begin exploring the possibility of forming such links with industry as this would allow for more direct communication with industry. Then this could enhance the opportunities to assist industry with focused training delivery, research etc.	http://www.napier.ac.uk/business-school/bright-red-triangle/Pages/Home.aspx
DENMARK: At Aalborg University the term Tourism Lab is being used as name for the internal organisation that handles especially small collaborative research projects sponsored by external industry stakeholders – but no training dimension is involved, except indirectly with the researchers involved being able to draw on these collaborations as examples in their teaching within the master programme	http://www.tru.cgs.aau.dk/
3.2. pedagogics of laboratories	
GLOBAL: Examples in research article entitled "Ergonagy: Its Relation to Pedagogy and Andragogy" by Tanaka and Ever, 1999	http://www.eric.ed.gov/PDFS/ED438464.pdf
SWEDEN: Scheduled sessions within the regular curriculum; 2 weeks/year restaurant operation	
UK: EI programmes follow similar criteria to academic qualifications- so they are accredited with nationally recognised qualifications (where applicable). Other courses who are credit bearing may be matched against nationally recognised qualification grading schemes (i.e. Scottish Higher Education and Funding Council or European Credit Transfer System) where applicable.	http://www.courses.napier.ac.uk/W30010.htm http://www.courses.napier.ac.uk/W30014.htm

Relevance to TOULL: The accreditation of the training is important for the participants because it acts as a benchmark of quality. It also allows participants to collect credit from several different courses that could eventually lead to a specific qualification or allow them to qualify for exemption from certain courses (through accreditation of *prior learning*).	
3.3. Organization of laboratory facilities	
SWEDEN: Within Umeå University – financed with public funding and partly private sponsorship	
UK: *Bright Red Triangle* is integrated in the university and using on campus facilities and staff to deliver teaching and research, cf above.	
DENMARK: Aalborg's Tourism Lab uses university facilities but staff cost partly (largely) financed by project funding from external stakeholders	

4. Advanced web portals in education/dissemination

4.1 Platforms integrating training and stakeholder relations	
None	
4.2 Platforms for life-long learning	
UK/DENMARK: Like many UK institutions Brighton and Coventry operates an interactive learning platform (Moodle appears to be the most widely used platform). They can only be accessed by students who are enrolled on a course – and integrates full-time students and students enrolled in life-long learning activities. While these create many opportunities for lecturers to provide diverse input, their efficient running is also demanding in terms of technical maintenance, staff training etc.	https://moodle.org/ https://studentcentral.brighton.ac.uk/ https://students.coventry.ac.uk/Pages/index.aspx https://cgs.moodle.aau.dk/
AUSTRIA: Tourismus-Studien-Austria is a searchable online database for tourism related research literature with a user-friendly search engine	http://oegaf.wu-wien.ac.at/stu/index.php?id=26&L=1
UK: Edinburgh Napier University has developed a strategy for enhancing use of technology in modules that underpins the design and delivery of all modules and programmes in the institution. *Relevance to TOULL*: Perhaps a similar strategy could be agreed to establish a minimum standard of expectations from the interactive platform that is adopted.	http://staff.napier.ac.uk/services/academic development/TechBenchmark/Pages/home.aspx
UK: Epedagogy online - This European Social Fund (ESF) project aims to develop the capacity of Scottish Further and Higher Education to deliver high quality, post-graduate education and training in eLearning Technologies and ePedagogy. It uses on-line and distance learning materials, methods and resources. These will let us deliver continuing personal and professional development (CPPD) training that will help to increase the number, output, quality and international focus of eLearning developments in Scotland. Educators and designers who study the modules will be able to create learning opportunities and experiences that can be accessed in SMEs and community centres, in colleges and at home at times convenient to their students. The project itself offers modules and full awards. In delivering this the project establishes a quality assured threshold standard that allows learners themselves to decide mode of delivery, time of study, peace of learning and extent of collaborative engagement.	http://epedagogyonline.napier.ac.uk/ http://epedagogyonline.napier.ac.uk/educational.htm

UK: A Lifelong Learning Account is a free, online service aimed at adults aged 16 + throughout England. It offers greater flexibility, control and choice for skills and learning development. A Lifelong Learning Account will give individuals access to a range of information and tools, to match their personal circumstances and needs - the results of which can be saved in a secure, private and easily accessible space. *Relevance to TOULL*: Perhaps more generic but allows individuals to manage their own learning by offering them one source where all information relating to training and personal development is concentrated.	http://skillsfundingagency.bis.gov.uk/providers/programmes/lla/
GLOBAL: Additional examples	http://www.extension.harvard.edu/login
GLOBAL: OTT is the world's leading provider of travel & tourism eLearning with over 120 free product training courses from the biggest names in the industry (IATA, aMaDEUS, Galileo, Sabre, AVIS, Star Alliance etc.	http://ott.travel/gds-training.aspx http://ott.travel/home.aspx
GLOBAL: Commercial video platform	http://www.pinkuniversity.de/
4.3 Platforms for stakeholder relations	
DENMARK: INNOTOUR is a WEB 2.0 platform for education, research and business development in tourism. It is dedicated to innovation. INNOTOUR is an experimental meeting place for academics, students and enterprises. Launched in 2009, INNOTOUR is based on content created by the users.	http://www.innotour.com/home/
UK: Example of sustainable tourism project based in Cornwall UK. On-line network, but offer bespoke training courses.	http://www.coastproject.co.uk/
UK: Edinburgh Beltane Public engagement and popularisation of science and academic research- mostly to the general public- industry could also benefit *Relevance to TOULL*: This could be an interesting way for the Russian partners to popularise the implications of their research for local communities (including industry). The Beltane network focuses mostly on natural sciences because this is an area that the UK government wishes to expand but the general idea could be adapted for tourism and hospitality's importance to local authorities and local communities (i.e. raising awareness; demonstrating how university research can be used by local businesses, etc.).	http://www.beltanenetwork.org/
UK: Knowledge Transfer Partnerships support UK businesses wanting to improve their competitiveness, productivity and performance by accessing the knowledge and expertise available within UK Universities and Colleges. These are partially funded by Government sponsored research councils, national governments and UK government departments (please see the links for full description). The idea is that skilled graduates are employed by the university and the industry partner to deliver an applied project that could not have been undertaken without the funding support. It is very efficient in delivering innovations to the industry while also producing high quality research and publications for the universities. The bids are competitive and there are specific calls for areas of interest by the funding bodies. For the time being most of the projects are focusing in technology and innovation, but there are also calls (such as those by the UK Research Funding Councils) that are broader in context and themes. *Relevance to TOULL*: This is a government funded initiative aiming to bring industry and academia together. The scale of the project is quite significant but local authorities in the Siberian partners' regions could be	http://www.ktponline.org.uk/ktp-aims http://www.ktponline.org.uk/sponsorship-criteria

encouraged to partially sponsor a smaller scale scheme that will follow the same principles.	
AUSTRIA: tourism-knowledgebase.at provides detailed information on research, educational, and consulting institutions, their core competences, project experience and collaboration potential. Provides support for : strategic planning of research in tourism ; analysing current projects/topics ; finding potential partners for future projects and tenders	http://oegaf.wu-wien.ac.at/tkb/index.php?id=81&L=1
GLOBAL: Additional examples	http://digitalknowledgecentre.in/files/2012/02/ICT-and-Tourism_Challenges-and-Opportunities.pdf http://ec.europa.eu/invest-in-research/pdf/download_en/knowledge_transfe_07.pdf http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0012/001202/120290e.pdf http://www.lesusacanada.org/sectors/iugi http://www.lesusacanada.org/sectors/iugi/useful-websites http://www.sarima.co.za/ http://www.unisa.ac.za/default.html

5. Triple-helix interface organisations

5.1 Platforms for triple-helix collaboration	
GLOBAL: Important experience from Trinidad-Tobago and the University of the West indies underlines the importance of maintaining "distinct boundaries between all three parties: academia, industry and state" in order to avoid universities becoming overwhelmed by sudden demands from the State and/or the Industry, for more political representation and economic gains.	http://www.heacademy.ac.uk/assets/hlst/documents/johlste/vol9no1/01AP244Busby_final04to12.pdf
AUSTRIA*:* Tirol Tourism Research is an online platform run by the Tirol Tourist Board and Management Center Innsbruck (part of Innsbruck University) It aims to make a large amount of strategic, market-level and current (and historical) tourism practice-relevant scientific knowledge/data accessible for development of tourism in Tyrol; setting marketing objectives/strategies and their implementation; coordination of local/regional tourism organizations. The content is existing data and analysis (fact sheets, bulletins, MAFO results, trend studies, national and international statistics, research, e-books, conference abstracts, research papers). It provides a comprehensive source of Tyrolean tourism information/data, but does not offer private consultancy services to industry.	http://www.ttr.tirol.at/ http://www.mci.edu/
AUSTRIA: TourMIS is a marketing-Information-System for tourism managers in the form of an online portal which provides information and	http://www.tourmis.info/index_e.html

decision support for tourism managers and scholars. Provides on-line tourism survey data/ statistics (accommodation/attraction visitors/latest trends) for Austria/Europe as well as various tools to transform data into management information. Open to all authorized tourism organizations, societies, tourism consultants, companies, tourism training centers, pressure groups, etc. in Austria and abroad. Portal also includes useful links/definitions/background information as well as a guestbook for questions/inquiries.	
UK: Tourism Intelligence Scotland, a now defunct but still interesting website linking research, private and public sector organisations. Event and workshop section is still regularly updated. Conferences, workshops and events, many of which are free, offer a great way of networking with others. Sponsored by national DMO and economic development agencies.	http://www.tourism-intelligence.co.uk/
UK: Edinburgh Tourism Action Group is a public private partnership of businesses that make up Edinburgh's tourism sector- includes participation of tourism academics. By building a strong tourism community, providing a network for communication and bringing business together to share best practice, collaborate and innovate, ETAG aims to improve tourism business performance, enhance the visitor experience and strengthen Edinburgh's position as a world class visitor destination.	http://www.etag.org.uk/home.asp
DENMARK: INNOTOUR is a WEB 2.0 platform for education, research and business development in tourism, an example of a virtual platform for collaboration that also is to some extent linked to events (lectures) but apperently not directly to e.g. joint or externally sponsored projects.	http://www.innotour.com
EUROPE: See Section 3.1 of table above for triple-helix-style laboratories.	
5.2 User integration through activities	
AUSTRIA: Tirol Tourism Research sends a newsletter to members 4 times a year. Planning a new project in 2013 for benchmarking tourism activities in all alpine countries to be linked/integrated in the TTR website.	
AUSTRIA: TourMIS runs an annual Users' Workshop, organised by MODUL University Vienna	http://www.modul.ac.at/sites/modul/files/Program%20TourMIS%20Workshop%202012.pdf
UK: ETAG annual conference and series of seminars. ETAG Full Group meets approximately every two months and the agenda, minutes, presentations and updates are available online.	http://www.etag.org.uk/etagmeetings.asp
5.3 Triple-helix organisation	
AUSTRIA: Tirol Tourism Research was Established 2006, Tourism Department at MCI Management Center Innsbruck and Tyrolean Tourism Board are equal partners and were responsible for project planning, website design, content and marketing. Established with funds from Tyrolean Science Fund and Tyrolean Tourism Board. Currently funded by local government funds. Does not provide consultancy but give advice on current tourism issues/topics via the website and cooperate with the main Austrian tourism consultancies who also provide content for website ('Expert Opinions'). Open access, no fees, email registration required.	
AUSTRIA: TourMIS is a development of the Department of Tourism and Hospitality Management at MODUL University Vienna, the Institute for Tourism and Leisure Studies (ITL) at the Vienna University of Economics,	

and the Austrian National Tourist Office. Since 2000 this initiative has provided the tourism industry with predominantly free access to overall data and functions of TourMIS (registration is required). Maintenance costs are covered a consortium of the most important initiators of market research projects in Austria and Europe who also update the comprehensive database. The programme modules contained in the method-base are developed according to the specific requirements of tourism managers at the Department of Tourism and Hospitality Management at MODUL University Vienna.	
UK: Edinburgh Tourism Action Group (ETAG) is a non-profit making unincorporated association whose overall aim is to make Edinburgh one of Europe's premier capital city destinations, by offering visitors a first class tourism experience. The tourism sector in Edinburgh is made up of some 3000 businesses, many of which are represented by collaborative industry groups and associations. In turn these Edinburgh groups are represented within the ETAG membership on the ETAG Full Group. ETAG's main forum is the Full Group, which comprises around 30 representatives from across Edinburgh's tourism sector. ETAG is supported by Scottish Enterprise, who provides both project management and financial resources where appropriate.	http://www.etag.org.uk/about-etag.asp http://www.etag.org.uk/about-etag-steering.asp